



April 1, 2022

Ms. Michelle Arsenault, Advisory Committee Specialist
National Organic Standards Board
USDA-AMS-NOP
1400 Independence Ave., SW.,
Room 2642-S., Mail Stop 0268
Washington, DC 20250-0268

Submitted via [Regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov).

RE: Docket # AMS-NOP-21-0087

NOSB Crops, Livestock, and Handling Subcommittee 2024 Sunset Reviews

Dear NOSB Members:

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments on the 2022 Sunset Review Materials. MOSA certifies over 2,000 organic operations throughout the United States, including approximately 730 livestock operations, 1,750 crop operations, and 325 handling operations. Almost all MOSA certified operations use some National List materials.

MOSA's italicized comments after the individual materials below include information taken from our database, as well as anecdotal comments from staff regarding their experiences during file review. We've provided answers to NOSB questions where we have information to offer. Our compiled information below does not include any totals for Material Review Organizations (MRO) such as OMRI, WSDA, CDFR, or EPA listed materials, nor certified organic inputs or ingredients in use on MOSA certified operations, because we do not record ingredients for those materials in our database. MOSA clients may be, and likely are, using additional materials under the review and oversight of another organic organization that contain materials under review.

2024 Livestock Sunset Reviews: §205.603

§205.603 Sunsets: Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic livestock production:

Chlorhexidine

How often is chlorhexidine used as an aid in controlling bacteria that causes mastitis?

MOSA has approximately 15 materials containing chlorhexidine listed for use more than 50 times on clients' input inventories. The majority are teat dip products, which we've approved for use when other germicidal agents have lost their effectiveness. Chlorhexidine is regularly requested as an alternative product to common iodine products. As a side note, the 2019 change expanding the restricted use from "surgical procedures" to "medical procedures" enables expanded use of this input.

Glucose

1. The National List does not currently place any use restriction on glucose other than the placement of the listing for use as a disinfectant, sanitizer, or medical treatment as applicable. Is

further clarification or annotation needed for this substance on the National List? 2. The National List references multiple substances for the treatment of ketosis, including propylene glycol, calcium propionate, calcium borogluconate, and electrolytes. Is glucose equally necessary and effective as a tool for organic farmers for treatment of all stages of the development of this condition?

We rarely see glucose containing products used for anything other than as an electrolyte and we have approximately ten clients using products for treatment. We do not think further classification or annotation is needed, and in general, we think “electrolytes” covers the specific listings for other materials mentioned in the #2.

Tolazoline

Tolazoline is a synthetic substance that is limited to use only by prescription from a veterinarian to reverse the effects of the sedative xylazine. Are there any new non-synthetic substances that can be used to reverse the effect of the sedative xylazine as effectively as tolazoline?

MOSA has three clients who list tolazoline containing materials on their input inventories for reversal of xylazine containing sedatives, though we have approximately 20 clients who note using xylazine compounds. We are not aware of any other reversal drugs being used.

Copper sulfate

1. Can the consistent use of foot trimming allow for the elimination of copper sulfate on dairy farms? 2. Have other foot bath treatments of similar efficacy come on to the market?

We have almost 20 inputs containing copper sulfate materials listed on approximately 115 client input inventories. Copper is a common hoof treatment material in use on MOSA certified operations. When zinc sulfate was listed, we expected the amount of copper sulfate use to decrease, but it has not, and we surprisingly do not have any clients using a zinc sulfate hoof care product.

Elemental sulfur

Are alternatives sufficient to control external livestock pests?

MOSA notes that only two clients are using an elemental sulfur product to control external livestock pests.

Lidocaine

1. Since lidocaine was last reviewed have alternative anesthetic substances emerged?

Lidocaine is one of the most common anesthetics in use by MOSA clients. More than 100 input inventories list lidocaine injections. Dehorning is the most common use.

2024 Handling Sunset Reviews: §205.605 & §205.606 (pdf)

§205.605(a) Sunsets: Nonagricultural (Nonorganic) substances allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic” or “made with organic (specified ingredients or food group(s)).”:

Attapulgit

1. Is attapulgit used today in organic production? 2. What industries are most impacted if removed from the NL? 3. Do the health concerns from mining attapulgit outweigh the need for organic use?

MOSA notes attapulgit is listed as an ingredient in one certified organic Livestock Feed Product which is in use by one client. We have no processing and handling operations with this material listed for use.

Bentonite

The subcommittee seeks public comment to specifically address the ongoing need for bentonite, given other similar (although perhaps not identical) substances.

Bentonite is a very common ingredient in livestock feed supplements, organic and nonorganic, as well as for healthcare, and for other crop and livestock uses. It is an allowed natural material. For handling however, we have no recorded use of this material.

Diatomaceous earth

1. Are stakeholders continuing to use DE today in organic production? 2. Have there been any changes to the environmental issues of DE production? 3. Are there alternative filtration aids allowing the removal of DE from the NL?

Diatomaceous earth is a very common input in all aspects of organic crop and livestock production. For handling, it is mainly used as a pest control product - approved under section 205.271(c) as a natural substance. We only have a handful of clients who use DE as a processing aid for filtering.

Magnesium chloride

1. Is the use of magnesium chloride as a color enhancement consistent with organic principles? 2. There appear to be other materials on the National List (e.g., Glucono delta-lactone and calcium sulfate) that perform the same or similar functions most specifically in tofu production. The subcommittee is requesting information as to whether these alternatives offer the same or similar functionality and essentiality?

MOSA has reviewed only one magnesium chloride ingredient in a salt product.

Nitrogen

Nitrogen is a common processing aid on MOSA certified operations. We have almost 15 products in use by over 20 clients.

Sodium carbonate

1. Is this material still essential for organic handling and processing? 2. Are there alternative materials that can replace sodium carbonate? 3. What are the relative environmental impacts of trona mining or brine extraction during production of sodium carbonate? 4. Is sodium carbonate produced from trona or brine extraction non-synthetic?

All database entries we have are for "bicarbonate," which is a common ingredient in Livestock Feed products. We are happy to follow clear guidance on sodium carbonate and bicarbonate and recognize that any nonsynthetic/synthetic determinations affect all categories of products.

§205.605(b) Sunsets: Nonagricultural (Nonorganic) substances allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as "organic" or "made with organic (specified ingredients or food group(s)).":

Acidified sodium chlorite

1. Is the substance essential for organic food production? 2. Since the material was last reviewed, have additional commercially available alternatives emerged?

We have no processors using this material.

Carbon dioxide

1. Is carbon dioxide essential for organic food production? 2. Since the material was last reviewed, have additional commercially available alternatives emerged?

We have approximately ten carbon dioxide materials in use by more than 20 organic handling operations.

Sodium phosphates

1. How essential are sodium phosphates to your operations or the operations of your stakeholders? Are there other natural substances or synthetic substances on the National List that could perform the same essential functions as sodium phosphates? 2. Do you have any new and compelling evidence that health impacts from sodium phosphates are significant?

Sodium phosphates appear as an ingredient on ~ten handler operations.

§205.606 Sunsets: Nonorganically produced agricultural products allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic.”:

Casings, from processed intestines.

1. How much potential is there for a certified organic casings market? 2. Is separation at the slaughterhouse still a barrier to the availability of certified organic supply?

We have one manufacturer listed in our materials database who sells three types of casings - natural sheep, beef, and hog casings. These three products are in use by the same MOSA certified handler. Three other MOSA certified meat processors are using natural intestine casings from a single manufacturer.

A search in the NOP's Organic Integrity Database for “intestine” yields one result listing beef intestines.

Pectin

1. Has an organic source of pectin become commercially available?

MOSA has five processing ingredients containing pectin in use by handlers.

Potassium acid tartrate

1. Is there adequate supply of organically produced potassium acid tartrate to meet commercial needs?

No ingredients recorded.

2024 Crops Sunset Reviews: §205.601 & §205.602 (pdf)

§205.601 Sunsets: Synthetic substances allowed for use in organic crop production:

Herbicides, soap-based

This category is hard to search our database on since ingredients can vary, and clients often use OMRI-listed products for use in farmstead maintenance (roadways, ditches, right of ways, building perimeters) and ornamental crops.

Biodegradable biobased mulch film

Is there new information on the availability of 100% BBMF? (*meaning 100% biobased*)

We are not aware of any 100% biobased, biodegradable mulch film. We do not have any clients using a biodegradable biobased product (since they are prohibited), but we are aware that more than 210 MOSA certified operations are using synthetic plastic mulch products.

We caution NOSB to use the correct terminology for this material. The National Listing and §205.2 definition is for biodegradable biobased mulch film. There are four criteria for this material: 1) compostability specifications; 2) 90% biodegradation specifications; 3) [100%] biobased specifications; and 4) produced without organisms or feedstock derived from excluded methods. While materials on the market may meet one or two of these criteria,

meeting all four is essentially unheard of. We encouraged NOSB to evaluate products on the market, and if there are no viable products available to meet the new recommendation for 80% biobased content, that this material be allowed to sunset. Its inclusion on the National List is just taking up space.

Boric acid

Boric acid is an ingredient in a few facility pest management products for use on all types of operations - crop, livestock and handling. Its listing on the crops list is necessary for it to continue to be allowed on handling operations.

Sticky traps/barriers

This is a difficult category to search in our database. As best as we can tell, we have just several clients using a sticky trap or barrier in their crop production as a Crop Pesticide though we have many clients using sticky traps and barriers for crop, livestock, and handling Facility Pest Management.

Elemental sulfur (h)(2)

1. Are there cultural practices that can make slug and snail baits unnecessary? 2. Is it necessary to have sulfur-based products for slug management in addition to ferric phosphate?

Pesticide input listings in our database are not narrowed down to specifically single out snail and slug baits. In total, there are just a few inputs recorded containing elemental sulfur used for pesticide purposes. Most elemental sulfur is used in crop fertility or livestock feed materials.

Coppers, fixed

1. Are there organic alternatives to copper products that are more suitable for use in disease control? 2. Are there viable practices that can be used in situ to offset the toxic build-up of copper in soil and water?

We have just one copper octanoate containing Crop Pesticide input in our database in use by six clients. Copper sulfate is the only other copper ingredient listed.

Copper sulfate (i)(3)

1. Are there organic alternatives to copper sulfate that are more suitable for use as a fungicide? 2. Are there viable practices that can be used in situ to offset the toxic build-up of copper in soil and water?

We have one copper sulfate Crop Pesticide input listed as in use by one client.

Polyoxin D zinc salt

1. Is there a concern that cross-resistance to polyoxin D could negatively affect human health? 2. Is Polyoxin D zinc salt an effective fungicide?

No recorded inputs.

Humic acids

Humates, humic acid and fulvic acid are very common ingredients in crop products:

- We find 94 inputs in use by hundreds of clients with “humates” as the recorded ingredient; almost 60 inputs note “humic acid”; and approximately 45 inputs note “fulvic acid.” We note that some are in the same products as separate ingredients. Fulvic acid review criteria is clearly explained in NOP Handbook Guidance document 5034-1. Only nonsynthetic acids or water would be approved as extractants. This differs from humic acid review criteria, where alkali extracts are also acceptable.*

Micronutrients: Soluble boron products; and Sulfates, carbonates, oxides, or silicates of zinc, copper, iron, manganese, molybdenum, selenium, and cobalt

We have more than 200 micronutrient inputs in use by hundreds of clients, and we verify that all micronutrients in use are supported by a documented deficiency.

Vitamins ~~B1~~, C, E

Do vitamins C and E provide essential functions in organic crop production?

We have no clients using vitamin b1 (removal effective on March 30, 2022), and we are unable to search on single letters, a quirk in our database, so are unable to report how many clients use a Vitamin C or E crop product.

Squid byproducts

No clients using squid byproducts.

Thank you for your review of 2024 sunset materials and for your maintenance of the National List.

Respectfully submitted,

The MOSA Certification Team